



Available Online

Journal of Education and Social Studies

ISSN: 2789-8075 (Online), 2789-8067 (Print)

<http://www.scienceimpactpub.com/jess>

TOWARDS A STRATEGY FOR PRO-POOR TOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN: EXPLORING NEW HORIZONS

Mahmood Ul Hassan * and Masood Sarwar Awan

Department of Economics, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan

ABSTRACT

The study holds significance as it has the potential to establish sustainable and inclusive tourism practices in Pakistan, simultaneously promoting economic growth and addressing the requirements of marginalized communities. This study tried to explore the hidden tourist attractions for pro-poor tourism development in Pakistan and specifically studied the tourist attractions of Khushab district. Focus group discussion method have been used to collect information from the respective area. Moreover, the study tried to identify the strengths and weaknesses of the tourism industry to make Khushab district as one of the good tourist attraction points of Pakistan. The study reveals that the travel industry faces challenges in various areas, including limited advertising efforts, inadequate infrastructure, and inadequate transportation. Stakeholders suggest the need for improved facilities, particularly for women and children, and the need for redesigning and examining significant structures and locations. They also advocate for liberal government approaches to support local and global investments, land acquisition, and promoting new ventures. Governments are increasingly focusing on promoting and promoting the travel industry, but a proper physical and restricted system is crucial for its growth.

Keywords: Tourism led Growth; Khushab District; Pro-Poor Tourism.

* Email: mahmood.hassan@uos.edu.pk

© The Author(s) 2023.

<https://doi.org/10.52223/jess.2023.4308>

Received: July 15, 2023; Revised: September 29, 2023; Accepted: October 13, 2023

This is an open-access article under the CC BY license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

INTRODUCTION

Pakistan is rich in its tourist locations, proposing an assorted scope of decisions for various kinds of travelers. Pakistan is one of the world's oldest civilizations, with breathtaking scenery, the highest mountains in the world, countless religious and historic sites, one-of-a-kind arts and crafts, and a rich culture and tradition (Malik et al., 2010). According to the World Travel and Tourism Council's (WTTC) Economic Impact 2017 report for Pakistan, tourism and the travel sector directly contributed 2.8 percent to the country's GDP. In 2016, there were 1,081 million foreign travellers, according to the World Tourism Organisation. In 2014, 0.965 million foreign visitors were scheduled to visit Pakistan, up from 0.557 million in 2000. Pakistan's share in the global tourist market in 2016 was only 0.09 percent, much below its potential. Pakistan received 5.5 percent of South Asia's 17.5 million international tourists, compared to 44 percent in India, 28.4% in Iran, and 7% in the Maldives. Europe accounted for 44% of total international visitor visits in Pakistan in terms of territorial distribution, with a substantial part of these being overseas Pakistanis from the United Kingdom. South Asia was the second most popular destination for foreign tourists in Pakistan, accounting for 21% of all visitors. Sikhs from India made up a large portion of these visitors, who came for religious holidays and to visit holy sites. Furthermore, almost half of all foreign tourists visit Pakistan to see friends and relatives (VFR). The majority of these visitors do not participate in traditional tourist events. In reality, just 14.7 percent of all visitors to Pakistan come to have a good time.

This low proportion of visitors in overall arrivals is a direct indication of the tourism sector's untapped potential (PILDAT, 2017). In 2017, Pakistan got just \$315 million in income from international visitors out of a total spend of \$31.4 billion in South Asia. India was the leading beneficiary of international visitor expenditure in 2017, with US\$ 21 billion (Du et al., 2014; Sadruddin, 2011).

Similarly, in terms of environmental sustainability, the country is placed 141st out of 141 countries and in terms of tourist infrastructure (107th out of 141 countries). Pakistan's status as one of the world's cheapest tourist destinations, placing ninth in Price Competitiveness and ranking sixth in Cultural Resources and Business Opportunities, are all approximately beneficial considerations for the country's tourism business (Ozturk et al., 2023). After the finish of the Second World War, the travel industry has become a worldwide wonder. The fast expansion in the travel industry request has driven numerous administrations to put resources into the travel industry. Pakistan couldn't be a special case and embraced the travel industry as an option financial improvement system to assume a significant part in monetary development (Nissan et al., 2011). Notwithstanding, Pakistan has become the focal point of incessant fear monger exercises by certain coordinated psychological militant associations during the previous decade. Within the sight of such agitation and fear based oppressor exercises in the North Area of Pakistan, the travel industry has been sprinkled in Pakistan. To accomplish favorable to the travel industry advancement and to restore the travel industry in Pakistan, there is a need to investigate the covered up and less-engaged vacation destinations in Pakistan.

The TDCP entryway recognizes 480 destinations of traveler interest across Punjab. Out of these, 106 locales are of chronicled significance, 120 strict, and a further 26 of both strict and recorded significance. Seventeen of the destinations of pious or verifiable significance pull in more than 1,000,000 yearly guests every, 22 draws in the middle 0.5 to 1 million yearly guests, 75 pull in the middle 0.1 to 0.5 million guests, and 138 pull in under 0.1 million guests. The pro-poor tourism (PPT) is the arrangement of strategies, plans, and mediations to open the chances for the poor just as the other gathering of the general public (Khan et al., 2020; Shahbaz et al., 2018). Literature supported the theoretical causes for expecting tourism to have a significant impact on economic development and as well as to pro-poor growth. Tourism also covers a wide range of industries, from huge multinational corporations to mini enterprises, and it can also give a rich diversity of downstream economic associations into the domestic economy. Tourism also plays a critical opportunity in other industries. The domestic and governmental areas of tourism and the development society are still at an initial stage of checking how to join the important economic approach of what is generally agreed as being the modern era's highest global factory for efficient poverty diminishing (Rahman et al., 2022; Gartner, 2008).

The tourist industry incomes are a significant wellspring of unfamiliar trade. Notwithstanding the immediate advantages, the travel industry is additionally a wellspring of unfamiliar direct speculations (FDI) that lead to financial development. Yet even with monetary achievement, the travel industry is not protected from the awful force of psychological warfare. Various human and normal-caused fiascos can influence the progression of the travel industry; however, the threat of psychological warfare can hurt the travel industry all the more harshly (Yang, 2015). Worldwide, psychological warfare was topped during the 80s, and its deadly impacts turned into the object of significant concern. Psychological warfare is required to affect traveler appearances, particularly in nations with huge and continuous fear based oppressor occurrences like Pakistan. Illegal intimidation is quite possibly the most predominant issue in the public eye and is advancing because of the expanded number of psychological oppressor gatherings and the measure of assets they can get (Luvanga & Shitundu, 2003). On the other hand, Tourism is a delicate industry, particularly in social orders with inconsistent governmental issues or accounts of ethnic, financial, or territorial pressures (Antonakakis et al., 2015; Shahzad et al., 2017; Chou, 2013).

A conflict on dread gives Pakistan a deficiency of 100 billion dollars, because of which the travel industry has hopelessly been harmed. Prior to the year 2000, more than one million tourists visited Pakistan;

however, following 9/11, this number has dropped to less than ten thousand. Only prior to 9/11, between 20 and 25 thousand tourists visited Gilgit-Baltistan. It has remained at 5,000 every year since the 9/11 incident. During the next year, this figure rose to 10 to 12 thousand. The psychological militant exercises devastated the inn business and its related business, and around 300,000 people in Gilgit Baltistan had direct or erroneous connections with the tourist industry region.

Unmistakably, we are in a time of testing what approaches can work for monetary turn of events and particularly the thousand years' advancement objectives. The need is to investigate the secret excellence and vacation destinations in Pakistan. As said, the travel industry serves Nilofar Bakhtiar; there were different spots in the country that could turn out to be acceptable places of interest; however, what was required was a legitimate government strategy that was missing (Marrocu et al., 2015).

However, knowing the multifaceted impacts of tourism, the officials and policymakers seem to be unable to develop such a policy that boosts tourism in Pakistan in the presence of such unrest and terrorist activities. The war against terrorism in the North Area of Pakistan splashed the tourism industry in those areas. The need of the time is to explore the hidden tourist attractions in Pakistan that may revive the tourist industry in Pakistan. District Khushab is the hidden tourist point that is blessed by the high mountains, gardens, natural lakes, rivers, and desert. This research explored the hidden tourist attractions for pro-poor tourism development in the district Khushab of Punjab province of Pakistan. By using the primary and secondary data sources, the study specifically targeted the Khushab district of Punjab province and explored not only the tourist attractions of Khushab district but also identified the strengths and weaknesses of tourist spots that make Khushab district one of the good tourist attractions points of Pakistan. Under the primary data, the study developed the survey instrument and conducted focus group discussions and in-depth interviews with several agents of the tourism industry, i.e., government officials, tourists, local community, etc., and investigated the need assessment of infrastructure and other facilities in order to start tourist industry in Khushab district.

The study would be a flagship to reformulate the tourism policy of Pakistan by exploring hidden and less focused tourist attractions and beauties of Pakistan. The first dinosaur fossils were found in the Barkhan district of Balochistan province, and Pakistan is now one of the few countries in the world with comparatively abundant dinosaur fossils. Ziarat, a hill station in Balochistan and Quaid-a-residence, Azam's draws visitors due to its breathtaking landscape, stable climate, and juniper forests. Mohenjo-Daro and Taxila, both in Pakistan, have wonderful excavated sites that have seen some of the world's greatest archaeological discoveries. The architectural temples of the Moghuls, the Khyber Pass, and the ancient unchanging rituals of the Kafir Kalash of the Chitral Valley are considered to be two of the world's oldest civilizations. Moreover, Sindh's dry desert regions add beauty to the country and make it a popular tourist destination in South Asia for nature lovers. These and other several beauties of Pakistan need to be focused on for pro-poor tourism development in Pakistan. The study tried to explore the hidden tourist attractions for pro-poor tourism development in Pakistan and specifically studied the tourist attractions of Khushab district. Moreover, the study tried to identify the strengths and weaknesses of the tourism industry to make the Khushab district one of Pakistan's good tourist attraction points.

Profile of District Khushab

The major manifesto of Imran Khan's government is to promote tourism, and policymakers are expecting that after COVID-19, the statistics of tourism will be different. The government believes that tourism is a tool that can be a factor in boosting foreign direct investment. The World Travel and Tourism Council reported that the contribution of world tourism in growth in 2019 increased by 3.5% as compared to the last five years was 2.5%. As the benefits of tourism mentioned above, it also has a problem of environmental degradation and damage to local tourists, so the government must take into account both benefits and losses. COVID-19 adversely affected the growth rate of tourism by blocking international travel, closing all tourist places, and affecting the salaried persons belonging to that sector. UNEP and WTO suggested that

in order to counter the benefits and loss of tourism, there is a need to conduct a systematic study on that matter (comprehensive look). WTO reported that the Pakistan tourism sector may reduce 20 to 30 percent of global tourists and also have a sound effect on the temporarily employed community.

District Khushab: A Glimpse

Geographical importance

Khushab District is a district in Pakistan's Punjab province, with Jauharabad as its administrative capital. The district takes its name from the ancient city of Khushab, which is situated within its borders. Khushab is a city and a district in Pakistan's Punjab province, situated in the Sargodha Division. It is Pakistan's 77th largest city by population and a historical city on the Jhelum River's bank. According to the 1901 census, the population was 11,403. It is now 50,000. Khushab is located along the Jhelum River, between the cities of Sargodha and Mianwali. Khushab is made up of lowland agricultural plains, lakes, and hills. Parts of the Thal desert run through the district, which spans more than 70 miles (110 kilometers) and is located between the Indus and Jhelum rivers. Khushab is rated 42 in the country by Alif Ailaan's Pakistan District Education Ranking, with an education score of 65.42 and a learning score of 65.82. Khushab's preparedness level is 62.33.

In the Khushab district, 96.8% of the population speaks Punjabi, but in three distinct dialects: Awankari, Lehndi, and a Seraiki-like dialect. Khushab, Noorpur Thal, Quaidabad, and Nowshera, Soan Valley are the four tehsils of the district, but it is divided into three sections in terms of dialects spoken. Khushab is bordered by the districts of Sargodha, Chakwal, Mianwali, Jhang, and Bhakkar. As a result, the languages and cultures of the districts can be found in Khushab's surrounding areas. In the Quaidabad and Golewali districts, Mianwali culture and language have a stronghold. Pel Padhrar shares a lot of similarities with Chakwal.

In his Punjabi book on the history of the Khushab district, Imtiaz Hussain Imtiaz, a well-known author, mentions the three local dialects. Sher Shah Suri laid the foundation for Khushab city, and the Salt Range in the district dates back thousands of years. The dialects used by the locals are also centuries old. This district is divided into four circles based on the topography of the soil: Pahar, Mohar Barani, Mohar Nehri, Thal Nehri, and Thal Barani. The district's salt range contains valuable mineral resources such as salt, coal, and gypsum. Wild life abounds in the region. PAF Base at Sakesar, an important facility, is located at a height of 5000 feet above sea level. Gram, Wheat, Rice, and Sugar Cane are the district's main crops. Rainfall decreases rapidly as one travels further into the valley than in the dry, hot Thal district. At Khushab, the average rainfall is about 32.5 cm, while at Mitha Tiwana on the Thal's outskirts, the average rainfall is 25 cm.

The average is about to reach summer at Naushera's salt range, which is 45cm, while it is about 55cm at share. The temperature at Khushab and Thal increases to 115 degrees Fahrenheit day after day in May and June. When the moon begins to rain, the temperature drops to as low as 80 degrees Fahrenheit at night. The month of January is the coldest, with temperatures often falling below 20 degrees Celsius. There are two magnificent lakes in the Soon Valley: Typically, Lake and Jahllar Lake.

Tourist attractions

Lakes: The district contains three lakes (Ochali, Khabbaki, and Jahllar). Kanhatti Garden, located near Khabbaki village in the Soon Valley, is the largest forest in Khushab district. Soon valley is shaped like a cup, surrounded by a stunning vista of rolling, asymmetrical green hills. The valley is known for its natural beauty, and in the winter, it serves as a haven for a variety of migratory birds. It is a valley of lakes and springs, lush green fertile fields, versatile mountains, incredible scenery, thick mixed forests, wildlife sanctuaries, brave cultures with strong traditions, rich archaeology, prehistoric sites, and ancient history. It is in Punjab's District Khushab's northwestern corner. Khabikki Lake is a salt water lake in Punjab, Pakistan, located in the Soan Sakaser Valley in the southern Salt Range region of Khushab District. The lack of drainage in the range has resulted in the creation of this lake. It is part of the Uchhali Wetlands Complex, and it is a Ramsar site. The lake is two kilometers long and one kilometer deep. On the right side of the bay, a hill gradually rises. A neighboring village is also called Khabikki. There are two places to stay, and boats

are open. TDCP has built a full-fledged leisure resort with all requisite amenities and easy access to the resort from the main road. Uchhali is a saltwater lake in Pakistan's Soan Sakaser Valley, in the southern Salt Range. The lack of drainage in the range has resulted in the creation of this lake. Sakaser, the Salt Range's highest peak at 1,522 meters (4,993 feet), towers over the lake. The lake is barren due to its salt water, but it provides beautiful scenery. Boats are available for rent for tourists at this lake.

Mountains and Water Fall: The ancient Amb Temples are located on Sakesar, the highest mountain in the Salt Range. The summit of Sakesar is 1522 meters (4946 feet) high and is located in Khushab District. Soon Valley is situated in central Punjab's Salt Range, in the Khushab District, about 110 kilometers from Sargodha and 290 kilometers from Islamabad. Soon valley is known for its spectacular natural scenery, which includes breathtaking streams, waterfalls, and trees. The deputy commissioners of three districts - Campbellpur (now Attock), Sargodha, and Mianwali - used to spend their summer vacations in Valley. It is the only mountain in central Punjab that has snow in the winter and warm summer weather. The natural beauty of the valley is similar to that of Murree and other northern regions, but it was sadly well-known and badly maintained. In this valley, Sakesar is the highest point of the Salt Range. The PAF established a small base in the 1950s for a high-powered radar that provides air defense cover due to its ideal location and height. The valley has been inhabited since antiquity. It's about 56 kilometers long, begins in Padhrar village, and is about 14 kilometers wide on average. Motorways link Islamabad (M2 Balkasar Interchange), Lahore (M2 Kalar Kahar Interchange), Sargodha, Khushab, and Mianwali to the Valley.

Fort: Tulhaath Fort is located on the Kathwayi-Jahlar road, near Her Do Sodhi Baala. This fort is reached by a rocky path. One and a half km of walking is required. This was a palace with water canals throughout. It appeared to us to be a fort similar to the Tulaajha and Akrand forts. The reason for this is that it not only has a defensive wall but is also built on a high peak or cliff. The stones used to build this castle are rectangular in form, long, and exceedingly hefty. 'Gabh' is the name of a local water spring. A defensive wall designed to protect the palace remains, as does the rock that served as the gate. Despite the fact that this fort was acknowledged by the British in their records before Pakistan's independence, it has been completely neglected by our administration and government. The men of Raja Tataar Khan constructed the Akrand fort in Soon Valley to protect the areas of Soon and Pakhar. The fort is surrounded by dark, dense trees. The fort is only accessible through one path, which runs parallel to Kanhatti Garden. The fort had horse stables, residential buildings, and arms stores, all of which are now in ruins. On the way to the fort, there is also a grave that is said to be Raja Tataar's. For historians, the fort is considered to be of great historical and architectural importance, not to mention the beautiful scenery it contains. We attempted to photograph the ruins from every perspective, but the camera was unable to record them in the same way.

Gardens: Kanhatti Park Soon Valley, with its stunning waterfalls and breathtaking views, is a famous tourist site in Soon Valley. Kanhatti Garden is accessible through the M2 Balkasar Interchange in Islamabad, the M2 KallarKahar Interchange in Lahore, Sargodha, Khushab, and Mainwali. It is located in the district of Khushab, in Soon Valley. Islamabad is 290 miles from here, Lahore is 300 kilometers, and Sargodha is 120 km. Kanhatti Garden was built on August 18, 1933, by Major W Whet Burn, District Engineer, and the Shahpur District Board. Kanhatti is a Khabeki sub-village named after Kanhat, a distinctive rock near a natural water source. The orchard was sold to the District Board on November 2, 1934. The planting of the garden began in December 1934 and was completed in January-February 1935. Plants offered include almond, apricot, pineapple, nagpurisangtara, Valencia late, and Washington Navel. The PTDC took over the Kanhatti Rest House and Camping Site on November 29, 2014, after it had been under the supervision of the Khusab Agriculture Department. Kanhatti Garden is rectangular in shape, surrounded by reserve forest on three sides (5,014 acres) and private Kanhatti settlement lands on the north. The garden is home to natural plants and wildlife. There are about 15 distinct species of tall trees, 60 flowers, 20 bushes, and 15 various grasses in the garden. Kanhatti Garden is home to the biggest bird population in the Punjab Salt Range. Punjab Urial, Grey and Black partridges, golden orioles, and

woodpeckers, as well as six different native fish species, have all been seen in the garden water springs. Irrigation comes in three varieties: spring water, rainfall, and tube wells. Kanhati Garden is famous for its delicious sweet juicy late Valencia citrus variety (introduced from Florida, United States in 1932) that ripens totally in May and June, and no other site in Punjab can equal it. Kanhatti is the name given to this area because of the abundance of Kanhat rock. Layers of limestone and sandstone, as well as red marble, may be found throughout the region. The region's greatest mountain ranges are built of 120 million-year-old sandstone. The climate in the garden is arid, with scorching summers and chilly winters. The average lowest temperature in the region is 2 degrees Celsius, with a high temperature of 36 degrees Celsius. The average annual precipitation is 600 mm, the majority of which falls during the rainy season. The garden receives between 10 and 1,000 visitors each year, both local and from adjacent towns. Visitors include locals, university/college/school students, and the area's young population. The project "Development of Eco-Tourism in Soon Valley at Kanhatti Garden, Khabekhi, and Uchali Lake - Khushab" was approved by the PTDC Managing Director and is expected to be completed in 18 months. Soft interventions, on the other hand, will be finished at Kanhatti Garden in a few months. A campsite and camping facility, a garden viewpoint, a rest house, a caravan park, camel riding, hiking pathways, bird viewing and sightings of many other animal species, natural water springs, waterfalls, water mills, and water pools are among the building components of Kanhatti Garden.

Temples and other Religious Monuments: The Amb Temples, also known as Amb Sharif (Urdu for "Noble Amb"), are an abandoned Hindu temple complex in Pakistan's Punjab province on the western side of the Salt Range. The temple complex was erected during the 7th and 9th century CE during the rule of the Hindu Shahi dynasty. The ruins are located in Pakistan's Soon Valley, atop the Sakesar mountain, near the town of Amb Sharef. The Katas Raj Temples and the Tilla Jogian monastery complex are two of the Salt Range mountains' Hindu temples. The biggest temple is around 15 to 20 meters tall and stands on a square brick and mortar platform. It is regarded as the "highest" temple of the Hindu Shahi dynasty. The temple ruins include three stories, with stairwells leading down to the interior ambulatories. The temple's facade is decorated with Kashmiri style elements, including a cusped niche. The main temple is distinct from Kashmiri temples in that it lacks a pointed top. The main temple, on the other hand, is constructed in the same style as the neighboring Kalar and Kafir Kot temples in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa region. A smaller temple, about 75 meters to the west, has two floors or 7 to 8 meters high and is situated near a cliff. The temple has a separate vestibule chamber that faces the main temple. It was only a few meters away from a tiny temple that no longer existed. The fortress surrounded the whole temple complex, with the earliest structure dating back to the late Kushan era. In the late 1800s, Alexander Cunningham explored the site, and Daya Ram Sahni largely preserved it between 1922 and 1924. The temple had been robbed for decades, with the final remaining sculptures removed from the site and placed in the Lahore Museum in the late nineteenth century. The site is formally protected by Pakistan's Antiquities Act (1975).

METHODOLOGY

The study acquires two types of data for this study: primary data and secondary data. Primary data has been collected from the stakeholders of the tourism industry of Khushab as well as Punjab. Six focus group discussions have been conducted in the respective areas in which the stakeholders are invited. Tourist agents, persons from the hotel industry, and people from the local community were involved in those focus group discussions. Several in-depth interviews were also conducted with national, provincial, and district officials in order to make significant policies for tourism-led growth in Pakistan. The secondary data was collected from the websites of government departments, official documents and reports, news articles and publications, etc.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The in-depth interviews focus group discussions with the stakeholders of the tourism industry and the general public give immense knowledge about the growth of the tourism industry of Khushab District.

Policy on Tourism Investments

In addition to supporting tourist Public Private Partnerships (PPPs), an investment scheme to encourage capital enterprise in the tourism sector is needed. This kit should be included in a tourism investment strategy. Although more in-depth discussions on such a policy are needed, the following issues should undoubtedly be addressed.

Using Public Land and Assets

If state properties and publicly owned property can be sold to the government industry for growth and management, they can play a significant role in the development of the tourism sector. These will be particularly relevant in light of skyrocketing real estate values. However, based on previous experiences, government officials are usually wary of such purchases. Under the current PPP regime, there is a need to create a fair and open mechanism for providing protection to government officials (Shakouri et al., 2017). This could be accomplished without transferring title, and those assets/land could be rented to the private industry. These funds will also be used in joint partnerships through special purpose vehicles that are leased to those assets and have a government ownership interest. Many of these investments in SPV can be carried by TDCP as well.

Development Plans Must Be Approved

The state should not only ensure that all permits and applications for PPP projects are approved, but it should also make it easier for individual projects to do so, as close to meeting basic requirements that really should be explicitly set out. Such assurance from the public sector, maintaining the shortest possible time period in which these permits would be issued, will significantly boost investor morale.

Facilitation by a unified platform

The policy should have a single-window facilitation desk where officials from all related departments will sit to help all tourism sector investors. Investors would be discouraged from visiting a variety of agencies if such a desk existed, and they would be encouraged to invest instead.

Monetary structures

Any hospitality investment programmer should pay particular attention to financial arrangements for the effective completion of megaprojects that benefit the tourism industry. As previously mentioned, commercial banks in Pakistan have historically avoided project financing, with the exception of a few industries, such as oil, in addition to price differences in the industry.

Predictability of Tax Policy

Investor trust has been shaken by the latest tax reform debacle in the real estate market, and any promise could go a long way toward motivating them. Even otherwise qualified investors are often unable to commit because they anticipate unfavorable potential tax adjustments. As a result, the most serious obstacle and danger for the private sector is the unpredictable nature of tax policy. While the new spending strategy could ensure tax policy predictability in the provinces, it will not be able to do so in the national govt. According to reports, the Government of Punjab has already given similar assurances to Norelco, a Chinese firm, for the Orange Line Project. A similar opportunity for the tourism sector could help Punjab attract more investment. In order to promote investment in the tourism industry, the local government may consider shouldering the risk of any unfavorable policy reform for a set period of time.

Alternative Dispute

To mitigate lawsuits and provide an independent platform for investors for faster settlement of problems, the investment policy should propose an appropriate alternative conflict resolution process for resolving investment conflicts in the tourism field. Contract compliance is another sore spot for consumers who want to avoid costly and time-consuming lawsuits in order to settle conflicts.

Enrollment of the private sector in the development of hospitality and tourism skills

There are currently few private sector establishments in Pakistan that specialize in or offer international standard courses in accommodation, tourism, and fine arts. For a variety of factors, these disciplines have not been officially integrated into the degree programs of reputable research institutions/universities. The private sector has not been willing to participate in the tourist industry due to a lack of emphasis on the sector in the past. As a result, the industry's size has remained comparatively limited, resulting in a low need for specialist human resources. The hotel, café, tour, and travel industry's main business players have been able to build a workforce by recruiting unskilled or semi-skilled workers and educating them on the job. The food and beverage industry has seen tremendous growth over the years, with multinational chains joining and maintaining themselves. As a result, there has been a significant increase in the number of domestic brands that are similar to those seen in these multinational chains.

Tourism Skills Investor Conference and Seminars

Institutes in hospitality, as well as prospective buyers, are welcomed. These meetings can be held in collaboration with the private sector and in consultation with local government agencies. The goal should be to highlight Pakistan's enormous hotel and hospitality opportunities in order to encourage foreign organizations and investors to open hospitality schools in the region. The IFC, a member of the World Bank Group, maybe a potential participant in hospitality colleges. IFC invested \$150 million in Laureate Foreign Institutions in 2013 to increase access to high-quality higher education in developing markets. Laureate is the owner of a number of hospitality colleges.

Public-Private Partnership for the Creation of Staff and Service Users

In Lahore, the government and companies should invest in establishing a single international standard hospitality school. A professional kitchen lab should be available for students to learn and practice their skills. The facility may also have a small cafeteria where participants can function and which is open to the general public. It will be nice to have a small hotel on the grounds where the student's study and work. PSDF is also in talks with the Hashoo Group and Serena Hotels about funding some of their training courses.

Policy for Infrastructure

According to the PIDC Report 2015, indiscriminate infrastructure construction has hampered Pakistan's growth in the tourism sector, with nearly one out of every sixteen visitors complaining about that. There is a lack of security in Pakistan over the last decade. The war on terror has caused immense loss to Pakistan, and its entire image has been damaged. People have fear to visit Pakistan. The situation was better in the earlier five to six years, but still, Pakistan ranked 134th all over the world. Since the PTI took power, the situation has become better than before, and seventy percent of visitors arrived in 2018.

Shortage of market

Pakistan was ranked 121st out of the 140 countries. Maybe the reason behind this is identity issues or ineffective usage of social networking. Our PTDC web is badly built and has broken links.

Shortage of skilled workers

The problem here is people here are not qualified enough. There are no appropriate training courses available for the sector. The government has to provide better transport facilities, better roads, and better resting sites for tourists. Also, in Pakistan, the lack of internet facilities is an underlying issue. Many tourists

complained about connectivity issues. PTDC survey 2016 tells us that they interviewed almost twenty tourists, and most of them argued about shortages of ATMs.

Government regulations are inadequate

In 2011, the Federal Ministry of Tourism was eliminated. There are no proper policy rules and regulations, so the government should apply the policies that help to maximize the foreign venture.

In Pakistan, the hiring department is corrupt, which is why Pakistan is not moving towards development. Young and trained citizens are not employed in the industries in planned traditional ways. The other main problem is the growing population of Pakistan. So, our main problem is to fulfill the basic needs and current demands of the population. And also, Pakistan's huge share of the GDP is spent on the defense sector.

Pakistan also needs maintenance of the cultural sites. There are many historical sites that are visitable by tourists; if the government pays attention to their maintenance, it will be beneficial for the country. Nawaz Shareef worked on the infrastructure that increases our country's FDI and helps the tourist sector boom, but it may only be in the area of Punjab, and also, this work is done by foreign loans and funds for a country so it may not be beneficial for all over the country.

It is recommended that Pakistan give priority to basic infrastructure such as toilets, Roads, ATMs, CNG pumps, etc. Local authorities must be subject to checks and balances by the federal Authority, and the selection committee should be able to select applicants solely on the basis of their qualifications, which are Pakistan's infrastructure. Pakistan has suffered for a long time because of terror. All industries of Pakistan are heavily affected by terror, but the most affected are the traveling and tourist sectors. Then Pakistan's military forces stepped forward and started operations like Zarb-e-Azb. For many international visitors, the state's image of stability remains intact. Another problem is the dispute over ownership of Kashmir between Pakistan and India. Azad Kashmir Foreign tourists were not allowed to enter Azad Kashmir without NOC from the government of Pakistan. But despite rising tensions, Pakistani citizens are not allowed to enter the country. This has halted tourism in the region since last year. Last but not least, the issue is that emerges government protection policies for international visitors. Assigning police officers to group travel and even people fall into this category. This indicates that the country is already unsafe for travelers, and they are unable to travel freely.

Policies for Diversity in Tourism

Many countries have collected data on probable tourists and appropriate market research; they have implemented a coherent approach, mainly for the promotion and marketing of tourism in their respective countries, as well as the scope of expenditures and expenditures. Pakistan is widely known for its adventure tourism and culture. However, there is a lack of focus on the manufacture of other products of tourism, e.g., rural tourism, spiritual and eco-tourism, and sports tourism. Webb Jensen, a UNESCO representative to Pakistan, said that Pakistan possesses a diversity of cultural goods and services that must be utilized for economic, social, and sustainable development.

Unproductive participation in international tourism occasions

Unfortunately, Pakistan's participation in international tourism fairs has been ineffective. In 2017, the Report of Tourism Competitiveness, in order to attract tourism, Pakistan was ranked approximately 125/136 in terms of marketing effectiveness and branding. These numbers are disappointing and show that minimal efforts have been made to take advantage of Pakistan's unique scenery. Moreover, the people selected to be sent as delegations to such fairs have nothing to do with the tourism sector. Pakistan needs to mobilize itself to participate in such exhibitions and fairs by observing its neighbor, India. Graph that shows receipts tourists internationally as the percentage of GDP; it also describes that even contract to the other countries in South Asia (1.7% to 1.8% of the GDP), and Pakistan (0.4% to 0.7% of the GDP) has failed to influence and attract the international tourists.

Low preference in the sector of tourism

Another major reason for the lack of growth is that the tourism sector at the federal and provincial levels has not been given due attention to the fact that it could have a huge impact on Pakistan's economy and people. The 2015 Tourism Competition Report also confirmed this fact. In terms of prioritizing the tourism industry, in 2015, Pakistan's score was 120, which in 2017 dropped to 122.

IT inadequately uses

Even in this digital age, IT is not being used effectively to promote tourism. It is true that provincial tourist administrations have established a presence on the Internet via Facebook pages and websites. However, the websites plainly lack the services that travelers expect. These websites do not provide online hotel, transportation, or tourist guide information. To attract visitors and encourage them to visit domestic locations, a comprehensive internet tourism promotion package is required.

Inability to signify the soft image of Pakistan

The population of each country is an important component in determining the viability of the tourist business. This negative image is a key deterrent to international visitors visiting Pakistan. Our resource people also supported this problem because overseas visitors had previously told us about their poor perceptions of Pakistan. The travel and tourism business has produced 1,484,200 employments in the country, accounting for around 2.4% of all jobs available. The human resources involved in the Pakistan tourism and travel business are inept, and the country is ranked 127th in the world.

Lack of the criteria and qualifications in recruitment

Pakistani travel and tourism industry does not have at all appropriate criteria and qualifications for individual educational skills directly with theorists. This tendency can be traced back to an already common practice in a country where illiteracy rates are high, and the working class seldom chooses to pursue a degree in their respective fields because such standards are not required for jobs such as hotel staff, guides, etc. A central point to note here is that there are exemptions in an industry where employees and even the contract workers have some ability, but these cases are often limited to high-cost hotels and facilities that are complete and can't be a big part of the entire Industry.

Lack of available educational opportunities

The Pakistani travel and tourism business lacks the relevant standards and qualifications for individuals' educational skills that are associated with thinkers. This propensity may be traced back to a long-standing practice in a society where illiteracy is widespread, and the working class rarely decides to obtain a degree in their particular areas because such criteria are not necessary for positions such as hotel employees, guides, and so forth. A key point to remember here is that there are exclusions in the industry where employees and even contract workers have to have some ability, but these situations are generally restricted to high-priced hotels and facilities that are comprehensive and cannot be a large part of the total Industry.

Mismanagement of human capital

The industry has made a comeback since almost 2014/2015. Firms are operating on a small scale and are still young. This is because they cannot manage their human resource by not hiring the right people with skills to develop and work with better customer overhaul. Companies are not functioning to train their employees in new skills that are up to international standards. Pakistan's tourism industry is still an untapped impending.

At the federal level, the lack of tourism body

In June 2010, the Tourism Federal Ministry was eliminated following the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan, which proved to have a negative impact on the development of the tourism sector at the provincial level. This meant that important issues in the tourism sector were no longer seen or discussed at the national level. These important issues include maintaining and handling the overall

security condition in 2country, ensuring even issuance of Pakistani visas to tourists, setting up the country's image at the international level in the sector of tourism, improving the services and quality standard, etc.

Budgetary Distribution and Government Support

Regrettably, Fact that the sector of tourism is given less priority is also apparent from the fact that a very small portion of the total budget is allocated for the development of the tourism industry. For the past several years, Punjab has not had a proper policy or planning framework to guide tourism development and investment in the right direction.

Low coordination between the departments

Many departments, like highways, roads, environment, wildlife, forestry, etc., are connected with the sector of tourism. Almost all of these departments work in seclusion with the intention of supporting and establishing tourism activities. As a result, many opportunities for growth in tourism and opportunities for economic gain were lost. A closer look at the current institutional arrangements reveals that not only is there a problem of coordination among the various departments, but none of them has the skills or experience to oversee the heritage sites.

The incapability of the government to exertion as the facilitator

This means tourism organization management of the Punjab, TDCP, on which argument will be alert, is majorly included in operating its own marketable businesses. Many motels are under this management. It is an unquestionable reality that if the public sector or provincial government starts providing tourism services, then it will increase private investment. For a few years, the provincial and federal government has tried to take some steps toward PPPs (Public-private partnership). They have failed to make any significant investment, and we are unable to see any major joint venture in the tourism sector.

Lack of research in the sector of tourism

Unfortunately, Reliable and comprehensive data on foreign and domestic tourism in Pakistan is missing. There is a lack of research in all important areas of tourism promotion and development. Assists with research support in identifying the key consumer trends and consumer preferences in the industry and, thus, in evidence-based policy-making efforts. There is no appropriate mechanism for collecting and publishing data on tourist trends in Pakistan.

The area of tourism in Pakistan (in Punjab province) was established at the private level, but the government favors this sector because of the province's development. This sector works according to the rules and regulations that are set by the Punjab government. Capitalists who belong to this sector acquire a more positive response from the government for the province's development. The government understands that if the capitalists rush towards that sector of tourism and the government encourages them (in the shape of making friendly laws), then their supervision would be valuable, and private investment would be boosted; as a result, they will better dish up the province's economy. In this manner, the government launched different interesting programs to raise private sector contribution to the tourism zone and the government should not intervene in that sector. The government shouldn't work unconsciously to enhance the imaginable investment. It should accommodate the different friendly policies to boost their interest and infrastructure for the growth of the province.

Development of Tourism Zones

PPPs are defined as long-term contractual arrangements between the public and private sectors for the provision of an infrastructure facility and/or service, with a clear allocation of risks between the two parties. Public-private partnerships (PPPs) include the following characteristics: "Public-private partnerships (PPPs) have become common as a means of delivering services all over the world." Instead of acquiring a public asset and providing a public service, the private sector creates the asset through a

dedicated independent company (usually planned, funded, created, managed, and controlled by the private sector) and then delivers a public service.

CONCLUSION AND POLICY OPTIONS

Tourism has been a worldwide phenomenon since the end of World War II. Many policymakers have invested in tourism as a result of the dramatic growth in demand. Pakistan, like many other countries, has embraced tourism as an alternate urban development tool in order to contribute significantly to economic growth. Over the last decade, however, Pakistan has been the focal point of several terrorist attacks by armed terrorist groups. The tourism sector has exploded in Pakistan as a result of the instability and terrorist attacks in the country's north. The term "pro-poor growth" is used by policymakers and development economists to distinguish between economic development in general and economic development that benefits poor people. The poor and vulnerable are at the core of pro-poor development. Pro-poor tourism, like pro-poor prosperity, applies to programs and initiatives that fix poverty and have 'trickle-down' results, resulting in multidimensional net benefits for the poor. Pro-poor tourism (PPT) refers to a series of policies, plans, and strategies aimed at the opportunities for the vulnerable and other members of society. There are good reasons to believe that tourism would be a particularly effective driver for economic development, particularly for pro-poor growth. Tourism also includes a wide variety of businesses, from major multinational corporations to small businesses, which can include a diverse range of downstream economic connections with the local economy. Tourism also offers a vital avenue for off-farm diversification, which was described as a key – yet under-researched – feature of pro-poor development in the 1990s report (Ntibanyurwa, 2006). The tourism industry, both public and private, as well as the development community, is also in the early stages of figuring out how to use the important economic engine of what is widely regarded as the new millennium's largest global industry to effectively reduce poverty (Garza-Rodriguez, 2019; Suhel & Bashir, 2018).

The government of Pakistan is committed to developing comprehensive policies for driving the tourist industry with the 'Provincial Cultural and Heritage Tourism' project. The strategy, especially in Punjab, will help to establish a solid institutional structure for the tourist industry, setting up an enabling administrative system that charms interest in the stakeholders of the tourist industry, moving towards private area-controlled help conveyance, setting up quality guidelines and affirming wellbeing and security for tourists, and helping great talented labor force for the area. The study found that there is a need to frame further policies based on these strategy protocols through focused and articulate changes. It is hence needed to develop institutional changes in three dimensions – affirming administrative common coordination and game plan, fortifying focal administration limit inside commonplace government for dealing with the travel industry area, and setting in the private area drove the development and national government should dispatch an energetic Tourism Cell in Ministry of Inter Provincial Coordination. There is a need to reestablish the Institute of Tourism and Hotel Management (ITHM) and change it into a unique front-line association for aptitude headway through joint exertion with the private sector. PPP ventures should be promoted. Moreover, private parties can arrange different types of occasions with the permission of the government.

REFERENCES

- Antonakakis, N., Dragouni, M., & Filis, G. (2015). How strong is the linkage between tourism and economic growth in Europe?. *Economic Modelling*, 44, 142-155.
- Chou, M. C. (2013). Does tourism development promote economic growth in transition countries? A panel data analysis. *Economic modelling*, 33, 226-232.
- Du, D., Lew, A. A., & Ng, P. T. (2014). Tourism and economic growth. *Journal of Travel Research*, 55(4), 454–464. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0047287514563167>.

- Gartner, C. (2008). Tourism, development, and poverty reduction: A case study from Nkhata Bay, Malawi (Master's thesis, University of Waterloo).
<https://uwspace.uwaterloo.ca/handle/10012/3923>.
- Garza-Rodriguez, J. (2019). Tourism and poverty reduction in Mexico: An ARDL cointegration approach. *Sustainability*, 11, 845.
- Khan, A.; Bibi, S.; Ardito, L.; Lyu, J.; Hayat, H.; Arif, A.M. (2020). Revisiting the dynamics of tourism, economic growth, and environmental pollutants in the emerging economies—sustainable tourism policy implications. *Sustainability*, 12, 2533. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12062533>.
- Luvanga, N. & Shitundu, J. (2003). The role of tourism in poverty alleviation in Tanzania. University of Dar-es-Salaam Press, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania.
- Malik, S., Chaudhry, I. S., Sheikh, M. R., & Farooqi, F. S. (2010). Tourism, economic growth and current account deficit in Pakistan: Evidence from co-integration and causal analysis. *European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences*, 22(22), 21-31.
- Marrocu, E., Paci, R., & Zara, A. (2015). Micro-economic determinants of tourist expenditure: A quantile regression approach. *Tourism Management*, 50, 13–30.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2015.01.006>.
- Nissan, E., Galindo, M. A., & Méndez, M. T. (2011). Relationship between tourism and economic growth. *The Service Industries Journal*, 31(10), 1567-1572.
- Ntibanyurwa, A. (2006). Tourism as a factor of development. *Sustainable Tourism* 97: 1–12.
- Ozturk, I., Sharif, A., Godil, D. I., Yousuf, A., & Tahir, I. (2023). The dynamic nexus between international tourism and environmental degradation in top twenty tourist destinations: new insights from quantile-on-quantile approach. *Evaluation Review*, 47(3), 532–562.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0193841x221149809>.
- PILDAT. (2017). PILDAT Annual Report (2016-2017). <https://pildat.org/annual-reports1/pildat-annual-report-2016-2017>.
- Rahman, M. H., Voumik, L. C., Islam, M. J., Halim, M. A., & Esquivias, M. A. (2022). Economic growth, energy mix, and tourism-induced EKC hypothesis: Evidence from top ten tourist destinations. *Sustainability*, 14(24), 16328. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su142416328>.
- Sadrudin, M. M. (2011). Promotion strategies to alleviate poverty through tourism development in Sindh. *Journal of Managerial Sciences*, 5(2), 179-193.
- Shahbaz, M., Zakaria, M., Shahzad, S. J. H., & Mahalik, M. K. (2018). The energy consumption and economic growth nexus in top ten energy-consuming countries: Fresh evidence from using the quantile-on-quantile approach. *Energy Economics*, 71, 282–301. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eneco.2018.02.023>.
- Shahzad, S. J. H., Shahbaz, M., Ferrer, R., & Kumar, R. R. (2017). Tourism-led growth hypothesis in the top ten tourist destinations: New evidence using the quantile-on-quantile approach. *Tourism Management*, 60, 223–232. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2016.12.006>.
- Shakouri, B., Yazdi, S. K., Nategian, N., & Shikhrezaei, N. (2017). The relation between international tourism and economic growth. *Journal of Tourism Hospitality*, 6(2), 295. <https://doi.org/10.4172/2167-0269.1000295>.
- Suhel & Bashir, A. (2018). The role of tourism toward economic growth in the local economy. *Economic Journal of Emerging Markets*, 10(1), 32-39.
- Yang, L. (2015). Tourism development and poverty alleviation. travel and tourism research association. *Advancing Tourism Research Globally*. 5.
https://scholarworks.umass.edu/ttra/ttra2015/Qualitative_Research_Methods/5.