



Available Online

Journal of Education and Social Studies

ISSN: 2789-8075 (Online), 2789-8067 (Print)

<http://www.scienceimpactpub.com/jess>

EFFECTIVENESS OF INSTRUCTIONAL PLANNING AND STRATEGIES OF TEACHERS AS A NATIONAL PROFESSIONAL STANDARD FOR TEACHERS IN PAKISTAN

Khalid Mahmood Kiani¹, Nazir Haider Shah^{2,*} and Muhammad Azhar³

¹Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

²Department of Education, University of Kotli, AJ&K, Pakistan

³Deputy District Education Officer, Tehsil Jand, District Attock, School Education Department, Punjab, Pakistan

ABSTRACT

Implementation of national professional standards for teachers in Pakistan and finding their effects on the performance of working teachers remained a research proposition; this study was conducted to find the effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies of teachers as national professional standards for teachers in Pakistan. It was an ex facto causal-comparative study. The application and effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies were found by exercising the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system in secondary schools. The study population was 189 secondary school principals, 1872 secondary school teachers, and 40 conveners of monitoring evaluation teams and academic results of secondary schools. Stratified sampling techniques were opted to select a sample from a diverse population. 133 male and female secondary school principals, 270 secondary school teachers and 20 conveners from all over Pakistan. Semi-structured interviews for conveners and a five-point Likert scale questionnaire were developed for secondary school principals & secondary school teachers. A mixed method was used to analyse the qualitative and quantitative data. Data were analysed by using mean scores, difference, and t-value comparisons. It was concluded that secondary school teachers adopted the application of instructional planning and strategies with the need for improvement in the skill development aspect. In contrast, instructional planning and strategies proved effective in raising the performance of secondary school teachers. It is recommended that NPSTs in Pakistan would be devised and implemented from the primary to university level. There is a need for rigorous training of teachers to develop their skills aspects.

Keywords: Monitoring and evaluation; Mixed method; Learning environment; Ex-post facto.

* Email: nazirshah786@gmail.com

© The Author(s) 2022.

<https://doi.org/10.52223/jess.20223303>

This is an open-access article under the CC BY license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

INTRODUCTION

Various training and educational institutions impart pre-service education and training by adopting different contents and practices. As a result, uniformity in developing desired professional standards is lacking in prospective teachers. Global educational drive initiated in the mid of 1980. The sole purpose of this movement was to make classroom teaching practices effective. Its objective was to improve the academic level of students. As previous educational reformation process was proved failed to get educational quality. The main focus of these reforms was centred on the instructional role of a teacher and accountability for their classroom performance. These educational reforms directed to devise uniform educational practices, teacher monitoring & evaluation system and, more importantly, a standard-based performance internationally (Delanshere & Petrosky, 2004; Sachs, 2003). Moreover, as per Sahito and Vaisanen (2018), no doubt many

prospective teachers are getting pre-service training, but they lack professional knowledge and comprehension of content. Their delivery mode is not up to the standard, whereas professional standards for teachers direct the benchmarks to follow the academic procedures smoothly. Standards are set yardsticks that explain the necessary conditions, processes and procedures (Minimum Standards for Quality Education in Pakistan, 2017). But implementation of professional standards remained a priority as recent studies on professional standards globally, besides identifying discourses of standards but are seriously pointing to a degree of caution about the implementation of professional standards (Bourke, 2011; Bourke et al., 2012; Clarke & Moore, 2013; Chróinín et al., 2012; Tang et al., 2006). Many countries devised professional standards for teachers to evaluate and for accreditation of their performance. Similarly, AITSL (2011) preferred to develop professional standards for their teachers to raise academic quality. Professional standards may provide a thorough source of founding the keenness of prospective teachers (Hudson et al., 2016; Swabey et al., 2010). Theoretically, the Standards may be utilised simultaneously to standardise the profession and improve the status of the teaching profession (Leonard, 2012). The purpose of devising and applying professional standards and their Monitoring and Evaluation is to measure teachers' performance, resources and practices to achieve quality education. Shami and Hussain (2005) stress two important indicators for quality education: one is the observation of national professional standards for teachers, and the second is devising and upgrading the national education policies to enhance the professional quality of teachers. It is necessary because so little work has been done to conduct research about teacher educators and their methods in their professional practice (Vanassche & Kelchtermans, 2014). Whereas, according to Tuinamuana (2011), professional standards of teachers have a key contribution to the development of professional prospects teachers.

The discussion among experts regarding maintaining the quality of teaching and teacher education in educational institutions in Pakistan has remained highly important since the early 21st century (Akram & Zepeda, 2015; Butt, 2008; Dilshad, 2010; Government of Pakistan, 2009). For this very purpose, work started developing the national professional standards for teachers in Pakistan in recent years. The Federal Government of Pakistan developed ten national professional standards for teachers in Pakistan in 2009 with the help of the UNESCO STEP program. Teaching planning and strategies is one of these standards.

For devising the national professional standards for teachers in Pakistan, professional standards of the United States of America were taken as a model to follow and aspects of knowledge, disposition and skills were kept aligned with the professional standards of the United States of America (Chung & Kim, 2010). In this study application and effectiveness of one national professional standard, i.e. instructional planning and strategies, were studied in Federal government secondary schools. Following is the theme of this national professional standard (Government of Pakistan, 2009).

Instructional Planning and Strategies as National Professional Standard for teachers (NPSTs) in Pakistan

Teachers are expected to know and follow the steps of instructional planning and strategies. Teachers would be conscious of knowledge, techniques, and skills exercised in classrooms. They are also desired to possess the ability to apply a variety of activities and strategies for inciting critical thinking and problem-solving skills in students. The professional standard instructional planning and strategies have the following aspects:-

Knowledge and Understanding

Teachers are expected to know and comprehend the type of educational curriculum aims, goals and objectives, respective instructional processes and lesson planning. They might know the principles of

learning language skills, reading, writing and mathematics skills. They must know basic knowledge about needed learning resources and instructional technology. The teachers might know and comprehend modern learning strategies and styles to accelerate the learning process and impact methods of good classroom management.

Dispositions

Teachers must value and they committed to gaining learning goals, objectives of contents and curriculum. The teachers must improve the student's critical thinking and independent problem-solving skills. They must be able to use different methods to solve problems, including cooperative learning and collaboration.

Performance and Skills

Teachers might be involved in activities to design activities per students' age and learning needs and plan learning processes according to the classroom's needs. They must be capable of evaluating teaching aids and teaching contents and use strategies that make learning interesting. The teachers must possess the ability to develop effective lesson plans following ICT, instructional activities and modern learning aids. They might be able to adopt summative and formative methods of assessment (Government of Pakistan, 2009).

Statement of the Problem

National professional standards for teachers in Pakistan were implemented in Federal Government secondary schools in 2016. Since their application, an inquiry was required to find their outcomes. To assess the effectiveness of national professional standard instructional planning and strategies of secondary school teachers of federal government secondary schools, it was felt to monitor and evaluate the performance of secondary school teachers in instructional planning and strategies as a national professional standard.

Research Objectives

The research objectives were as under:

1. To assess the application of instructional planning and strategies by secondary school teachers.
2. To find out the effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies of secondary school teachers in Federal government secondary schools.

Hypothesis

The following were the hypothesis of the study:

1. There is no difference in the performance of secondary school teachers before and after the application of instructional planning and strategies as a national professional standard for teachers in Pakistan (NPSTs).
2. There is no effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies as national professional standards for teachers (NPSTs) in Pakistan in the context of the performance of secondary school teachers.

Delimitations

The following were the delimitations of the research study:-

1. Federal Government secondary schools under federal government educational institutions directorate Rawalpindi.
2. Principals of Federal Government secondary schools.
3. Secondary school teachers of Federal Government secondary schools.

4. The national professional standard for teachers in Pakistan, i.e. instructional planning and strategies.
5. Academic results of secondary school teachers (2016-2019) before and after application of instructional planning and strategies.

METHODOLOGY

It was an ex-post facto causal-comparative study in which the performance of secondary school teachers in the context of instructional planning and strategies was monitored and evaluated before and after its application. A monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system were implemented in Federal Government secondary schools in 2016 to evaluate the performance of secondary school teachers. Application of Instructional planning and strategies as a national professional standard was a cause as an independent variable, and its effect was assessed on dependent variables, i.e. performance of secondary school teachers.

Population, Sample and Procedure of the Study

The population of this study consisted of 189 secondary school principals, 1778 secondary school teachers and 42 conveners of quality audit teams. Stratified sampling techniques were adopted, through which 133 secondary school male and female principals were selected for their opinions about the performance of secondary school teachers in instructional planning and strategies. 270 male and female secondary school teachers were taken to give their self-opinions about their performance before and after the application and effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies. 20 conveners, male-female were selected to give their views about the application of instructional planning and strategies

To find the application of instructional planning and strategies, semi-structured interviews were developed for conveners of monitoring and evaluation teams. To find the effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies of secondary school teachers, questionnaires for principals and secondary school self-opinion were devised. Experts in relevant fields validated the research instruments, and their reliability level was found through Cronbach alpha values of 0.91. Academic results of the Federal Board of secondary schools were taken. The performance of secondary school teachers in instructional planning and strategies was taken and compared before and after applying this standard. At the same time, the validation of research instruments was done through 13 educational experts. Instruments were then pilot tested, and the reliability Cronbach alpha value was found to be 0.969.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Application of Instructional Planning and Strategies as National Professional Standards for Teachers (NPSTs)

Thematic analysis of Interviews of Convener

H₀₁: There is no difference in the performance of secondary school teachers due to before and after the application of instructional planning and strategies as national professional standards for teachers in Pakistan (NPSTs).

As per Tong et al. (2012), there is a domination of qualitative research social perspective and presents complete knowledge regarding human behavior, emotions, attitudes, and experiences. The main patterns in explaining qualitative research are positivist, interpretive, and critical analysis (Punch, 2013). Sparkes and Smith (2013) narrated the manageable style of examining the central themes. It tells the researchers to assess the theme more deeply. Semi-structured interviews of conveners were analysed inductively. The matrix method by Bryman (2012) was adopted to analyse the themes of interviews of conveners in which interviews of conveners were coded and marked. It is analysed through a table consisting of rows and

columns and allows the organisation of data by themes. In this method, repeated responses of conveners were identified as compared to less repeated. Bryman pointed out that counting repetition is considered an acceptable principle for analysing themes.

Thematic Analysis of Instructional Planning and Strategies

Twenty conveners were interviewed and pointed out that teachers adopted lesson planning and allied preparation procedures as teaching practices. Knowledge and comprehension and procedure of instructional planning and strategies were sound. Skills to meet the situational challenge are needed. Pragmatic application of the professional standard is mandatory to find the intended learning outcomes. Teachers have weak performance and skill modes. Analysis and counting of frequencies of repeated themes of conveners revealed that secondary school teachers' knowledge and understanding about this standard, i.e. instructional planning and strategies, were assessed 42%, 40 % application in disposition and 18% in performance and skills. Furthermore, conveners detailed the classroom performance aspects of secondary school teachers relating to instructional planning and strategies. Their main themes were divided into sub-themes. The repeated frequencies of sub-themes were counted and expressed in percentages. The common and repeated themes were marked in three categories and counted to obtain percentages. Agreed (A), neutral (N) or disagreed (DA) responses of the respondents were analysed as given below:-

Table 1. Thematic analysis of Secondary School Teachers aspects relating to Instructional Planning and Strategies (N=20).

Indicator	Statements	Agree	Neutral	Disagree
Teachers performance indicators relating to Instructional Planning and Strategies	Teachers preparation to use ICT	50%	20%	30%
	Status of Instructional planning and strategies	55%	10%	35%
	Participation level in Continuous professional development activities	70%	13%	17%

Table 1 indicates that 50% of secondary school principals opined that secondary school teachers had competence in the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT), and 30% of secondary school teachers didn't have professional skills to use ICT in classrooms. 55 % of secondary school teachers implemented instructional planning and strategies, whereas 35% didn't follow that national professional standard. 70% of secondary school teachers attended training courses/workshops, while 13% and 17 % strength of the teachers didn't take part in training activities.

Questionnaire for the Principals

Principals of secondary schools opined about the performance of secondary school teachers before and after implementing the M&E system. The analysis of their opinions is analysed in the light of the following research null hypothesis:

Ho₂: There is no effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies as national professional standards for teachers (NPSTs) in Pakistan in the context of the performance of secondary school teachers before and after its implementation.

Table 2 shows the mean opinion scores of principals about secondary school teachers before the implementation of instructional planning and strategies (teacher uses proper learning methods in the class) was monitored and evaluated was 3.47, found less than after implementation of this standard was 4.29. The calculated t-value was 23.238, higher than the table value of ±1.96. It indicated a significant difference between the two mean values before and after the implementation of instructional planning and

strategies. These results reveal that there is an improvement in secondary school teachers' performance after the implementation of instructional planning and strategies. So, Ho₂ is not accepted.

Table 2. Instructional Planning and Strategies as a National Professional Standard for Teachers Principals' Opinions About Performance of Secondary School Teachers (10-12) Items.

Statements	Category	Performance before implementation of instructional planning & strategies			Performance after implementation of instructional planning & strategies			t
		f	%age	Mean	f	%age	Mean	
Teacher uses appropriate teaching methods in the class	SA	19	7	3.47	124	46	4.29	23.238
	Agree	142	53		113	42		
	UD	55	20		23	9		
	DA	54	20		6	2		
	SDA	0	0		4	1		
Teacher possesses ability to use Audio Visual aids	SA	19	7	3.30	118	44	4.2	31.085
	Agree	112	41		110	41		
	UD	80	30		25	9		
	DA	50	19		11	4		
	SDA	9	3		6	2		
Teacher takes classes with preparation	SA	28	10	3.41	123	46	4.29	23.589
	Agree	117	43		116	43		
	UD	64	24		22	8		
	DA	60	22		3	1		
	SDA	1	0		6	2		

Table 2 reflects that the mean opinion scores of principals about secondary school teachers' ability to use audio-visual aids before its implementation were 3.30, less than after the implementation, which was 4.28. The calculated value t was 31.085, more than the table value ± 1.96 at 0.05. It is shown that significant difference was shown between the two mean values both before and after the implementation of instructional planning and strategies aspects. These results reveal improvement in secondary school teachers' performance after implementing instructional planning and strategies. So null hypothesis is rejected.

Table 2 reveals the mean opinion values of Principals about secondary school teachers taking classes with preparation before applying this standard was 3.41, which was found to be less than the mean score of 4.29 after the implementation of instructional planning and strategies. The t value was calculated to be 23.589,

which was more than the table value of ± 1.96 . The results reflected the improvement in secondary school teachers' performance after implementing instructional planning and strategies. So, the null hypothesis is rejected.

Self –opinions of Secondary School Teachers (SSTs)

Self-opinions of the secondary school teachers (SSTs) were assessed through five points likert questionnaire and analysed as below to verify the following hypothesis:

H_{02} : There exists no significant effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies of secondary school teachers of Federal Government Secondary schools.

Table 3. Instructional Planning and Strategies as a National Professional Standard for Teachers Performance of Secondary School Teachers as Per Their Self-Opinions (Items 10-12).

Statements	Category	Before implementation of instructional planning and strategies			After implementation instructional planning and strategies			t
		f	%age	Mean	f	%age	Mean	
I use appropriate teaching methods and styles in the class	SA	51	15	3.73	208	59	4.47	24.017
	Agree	200	57		119	34		
	UD	55	16		10	3		
	DA	40	11		5	1		
	SDA	4	1		8	2		
I possess ability to use audio visual aids	SA	39	11	3.40	175	50	4.36	33.990
	Agree	148	42		143	41		
	UD	92	26		19	5		
	DA	55	16		8	2		
	SDA	16	5		5	1		
I take classes with preparation	SA	55	16	3.70	240	69	4.57	33.422
	Agree	190	54		82	23		
	UD	57	16		17	5		
	DA	42	12		8	2		
	SDA	6	2		3	1		

Table 3 indicates the mean scores of self-opinion of secondary school teachers about their use of teaching methods and style of teaching before the implementation of instructional planning and strategies 3.73, which was found to be less as compared to the mean score of 4.47 after implementation. The t-value was calculated as 24.01, which was higher than the table value of ± 1.96 at 0.05. There was a difference between the mean values of pre and post-performance of SSTs. It indicates a significant improvement in the performance of secondary school teachers after the implementation of instructional planning and strategies. So, H_{02} is not accepted.

Table 3 reflects that self-opinion mean scores of secondary schoolteachers regarding their possession of the ability to use Audio-Visual aids was 3.40 before implementation of instructional planning and strategies, found less than after implementation, i.e. 4.36. The calculated t value was found to be 33.990, which was more than the table value ± 1.96 at 0.05. That pointed out the difference exists between the mean values of pre and post-performance of teachers. These results show the improvement in teachers' performance after implementing instructional planning and strategies. SO, H_{02} is rejected.

Table 3 reveals the mean score of secondary school teachers regarding taking classes with preparation before implementing instructional planning and strategies was 3.70, less than the mean score after implementation, which is 4.57. The *t* was calculated at 33.422, more than the table value ± 1.96 at 0.05. It indicates that mean values of pre and post-performance of secondary school teachers showed a difference. It showed the improvement in the performance of secondary school teachers after implementing instructional planning and strategies as a national professional standard. Therefore, H_0 is rejected.

Comparative Analysis of Academic Results of Secondary Schools where Instructional Planning and Strategies was implemented.

Monitoring and evaluation teams evaluated national professional standard instructional planning and strategies from 2016 to 2019 in sampled secondary schools. The academic results of sampled secondary schools were compared before and after implementing instructional planning and strategies. Van Bruggen (2010) pointed out that the inspection directorate took it important to make schools accountable for academic performance by gauging it through external examination results. Academic results comparison of secondary schools from 2013-2019 was made. It revealed significant improvement in the GPAs Grade point averages of secondary schools after the implementation of instructional planning and strategies as national professional standards as given below.

Table 4. Comparison of Academic Achievement of Secondary Schools (2013-2019).

GPA/percentage	Before implementation of instructional planning and strategies			After implementation of instructional planning and strategies			
	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Year							
GPA	3.14	3.76	3.13	4.00	4.24	4.40	4.59
Percentage	83.49	92.10	94.22	94.45	96.17	95.42	96.65

Source: FBlSE results gazettes (2013-2019), FBlSE Islamabad.

Triangulation of Qualitative and Quantitative Data

According to Carter et al. (2014), triangulation gives validity to the conclusions through which the conversion of different information is gathered from different sources. Triangulation possesses four categories: investigation triangulation, data triangulation, theory triangulation and methodological triangulation. Noble and Heale (2019) explain results gained through the triangulation method increase the credibility of findings. In this study, the application of instructional planning and strategies was analysed through a thematic analysis of convener interviews, whereas quantitative results were gained through questionnaires of secondary school principals and teachers. 82% opinions in favour of the application, whereas 18% of conveners pointed out skills aspects are weak. That is also verified by quantitative results of principals’ opinions and secondary school teachers’ self-opinions .which indicate its effectiveness. Diversion of results also indicated after triangulation as skills of teachers need improvement. Divergence is also indicated in the context of 50 % weak skills of use of ICT facilities by secondary school teachers in classrooms. The availability of ICT facilities in classrooms was assessed as weak during interviews with conveners, whereas the academic results of secondary school teachers show significant improvement.

Discussion

Ahmad (2011) concluded that monitoring of professional aspects of employees is considered a pertinent factor in maintaining high-performance standards of a department or an organisation. To keep the desired standard, the application and effectiveness of national professional standards for teachers were monitored & evaluated in the form of the performance of secondary school teachers. It is proved that secondary school

teachers adopted the teaching strategies. It is necessary to adopt and implement to attain good learning outcomes. According to Issac (2010), teaching strategies are generic outlines of the frame comprised of structure, learning outcomes and planned tactics, and it is necessary to implement the strategies. It has become a progressive need for teachers to exercise professional standards educators as an integral part of their professional behaviour because now there is emergent international stress on maintaining teacher quality; for this, it is necessary to execute professional standards. Through the application of professional standards, educators try to understand better what they believe, know, and comprehend and are capable of acting as professional practitioners in their teaching (Ingvarson, 1998; Kennedy, 2005). This research proved that teaching strategies and planning put positive effects on the performance of teachers and the academic results of students improved. As Kistner et al. (2010) also supported that due to adopting teaching strategies, students showed good performance. Hamman et al. (2000) and Moely et al. (1992) also concluded that teachers showed a difference in performance by adopting teaching strategies and instruction. But there is a weakness in the skills to tackle the challenges during the application of instructional strategies and planning. As Hunt et al. (2009) rightly pointed out, the real challenge for the teacher is not just identifying and getting command of certain effective instructional strategies and planning. The challenge is also to develop the skills to meet and match problems during the teaching-learning process directly related to student learning outcomes.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

On the basis of the results and discussions, two conclusions were made. First, it is proved that there is an application of instructional planning and strategies as a national professional standard for teachers (NPSTs) in Pakistan implemented in Federal government secondary schools of Pakistan. The professional standard needs some improvement in the skills development aspect, but mainly, it showed development in teachers' performance as analysed through monitoring and evaluating secondary school teachers' performance. Second, there is a significant improvement in the performance of secondary school teachers after the adaptation of instructional planning and strategies as a national professional standard for teachers (NPSTs) in Pakistan while taking their classes as per results of monitoring and evaluation done by M&E teams.

Three recommendations were made based on the conclusions. First, the Application and effectiveness of instructional planning and strategies reflected that national professional standards for teachers (NPSTs) might be devised and implemented for all tiers of education. Second, Teacher training might be the continuous feature to train the secondary school teachers for their skill development for effective application of instructional planning and management. Third, the Government of Pakistan may evaluate the effectiveness of all ten professional standards through continuous monitoring and evaluation system to plan strategies for improvement of instructional planning and strategies professional standards along with other standards. There is also a need to align the assessment system at the school and board level with national professional standards for teachers to make it a formal educational obligation for every teacher.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, M. (2011). Factors affecting initial teacher education in Pakistan: Historical analysis of policy network. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 2(13), 104-113.
- AITSL. (2011). *Australian Professional Standards for Teachers*. Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership, Melbourne: Education Services Australia.

- Akram, M. & Zepeda, S. J. (2015). Development and validation of a teacher self-assessment instrument. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, 9(2), 134-148.
- Bourke, T. (2011). *Teacher professional standards: Mirage or miracle cure – An archaeology of professionalism in education* (PhD thesis). Queensland University of Technology, Brisbane, Australia.
- Bourke, T., Ryan, M. E., & Lidstone, J. (2012). Reclaiming professionalism for geography education: Defending our own territory. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 28(7), 990–998.
- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social research methods* (4th ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Butt, G. (2008). Is the future secure for geography education?. *Geography*, 93(3), 158-165.
- Carter, N., Bryant-Lukosius, D., DiCenso, A., Blythe, J., & Neville, A. J. (2014). The Use of Triangulation in Qualitative Research. In *Oncology Nursing Forum* (Vol. 41, No. 5, pp. 545-547). Oncology Nursing Society.
- Chróinín, D. N., Tormey, R., & O’Sullivan, M. (2012). Beginning teacher standards for physical education: Promoting a democratic ideal?. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 28(1), 78-88.
- Chung, H. & Kim, H. (2010). Implementing professional standards in teacher preparation programs in the United States: Preservice teachers’ understanding of teaching standards. *KEDI Journal of Educational Policy*, 7(2), 355-377.
- Clarke, M., & Moore, A. (2013). Professional standards, teacher identities and an ethics of singularity. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 43(4), 487–500.
- Delanshere, G., & Petrosky, A. (2004). Political rationales and ideological stances of the standards-based reform of teacher education in the US. *Teacher and Teacher Education*, 20(1), 1-15.
- Dilshad, R. M. (2010). Assessing Quality of Teacher Education: A Student Perspective. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)*, 30(1), 85-97.
- Government of Pakistan (2009). *National education policy*. Islamabad: Ministry of Education. http://itacec.org/document/2015/7/National_Education_Policy_2009.pdf.
- Hamman, D., Berthelot, J., Saia, J., & Crowley, E. (2000). Teachers’ coaching of learning and its relation to students’ strategic learning. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 92(2), 342–348.
- Hudson, S. M., Hudson, P., Weatherby-Fell, N. L., & Shipway, B. (2016). Graduate standards for teachers: Final-year pre-service teachers potentially identify the gaps. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(9), 135-151.
- Hunt, G. H., Touzel, T. J., & Wiseman, D. G. (2009). *Effective Teaching: Preparation and Implementation*. Springfield, Illinois, Charles C. Thomas Publisher, Ltd.
- Ingvarson, L. (1998). Professional standards: A challenge for the AATE? *English in Australia*, 122, 31-44.
- Issac, J. C. (2010). *Methods and Strategies of Teaching: an overview*. Pondicherry University Press.
- Kennedy, M. M. (2005). *Inside teaching: How classroom life undermines reform*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctvjk2v64>
- Kistner, S., Rakoczy, K., Otto, B., Dignath-van Ewijk, C., Büttner, G., & Klieme, E. (2010). Promotion of self-regulated learning in classrooms: Investigating frequency, quality, and consequences for student performance. *Metacognition and Learning*, 5(2), 157–171.

- Leonard, S. N. (2012). Professional conversations: mentor teachers' theories-in-use using the Australian National professional standards for teachers. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 37(12), 78-94.
- Minimum Standards for Quality Education in Pakistan (2017). Federal Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Wing, Islamabad.
- Moely, B. E., Hart, S. S., Leal, L., Santulli, K. A., Rao, N., Johnson, T., & Hamilton, L. B. (1992). The teacher's role in facilitating memory and study strategy development in the elementary school classroom. *Child Development*, 63(3), 653-672.
- Noble, H., & Heale, R. (2019). Triangulation in research, with examples. *Evidence-based nursing*, 22(3), 67-68.
- Punch, K. F. (2013). *Introduction to Social Research: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. SAGE Publications.
- Sachs, J. (2003). Teacher professional standards: Controlling or developing teaching? *Teachers and Teaching*, 9(2), 175-186.
- Sahito, Z., & Vaisanen, P. (2018). Perception and Experience of Teacher Educators about Their Motivation: A Case Study Approach. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 9(3), 480-490.
- Shami, P. A., & Hussain, K. S. (2005). *Basic education in Pakistan*. Islamabad: Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education.
- Sparkes, A. C., & Smith, B. (2013). *Qualitative research methods in sport, exercise and health: From process to product*. Routledge.
- Swabey, K., Castleton, G., & Penney, D. (2010). Meeting the standards?: Exploring preparedness for teaching. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education (Online)*, 35(8), 29-46.
- Tang, S. Y. F., Cheng, M. M. H., & So, W. W. M. (2006). Supporting student teachers' professional learning with standards-referenced assessment. *Asia Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 34(2), 223-244.
- Tong, A., Flemming, K., McInnes, E., Oliver, S., & Craig, J. (2012). Enhancing transparency in reporting the synthesis of qualitative research: ENTREQ. *BMC medical research methodology*, 12(1), 1-8.
- Tuinamuana, K. (2011). Teacher professional standards, accountability, and ideology: Alternative discourses. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 36(12), 72-81.
- Van Bruggen, J.C. (2010). *Inspectorates of education in Europe; some comparative remarks about their tasks and work*. SICI Report. Retrieved from: www.sici-inspectorates.org.
- Vanassche, E., & Kelchtermans, G. (2014). Teacher educators' professionalism in practice: Positioning theory and personal interpretative framework. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 44, 117-127.